

A Comparative Study of Maulana Madoodi's views and Allama Asad's views on Modern Reformation of Islamic Civilization

Dr. Tariq Mahmood Khan^{1*}, Prof. Dr. THAMEEM USHAMA²

^{*1} Tariq Mahmood postdoc fellow, ISTAC, International Islamic University of Malaysia

² Professor, department of ISTAC, International Islamic University, Malaysia

Corresponding Author Dr. Tariq Mahmood Khan (Postdoc Fellow, ISTAC, International Islamic University of Malaysia)

Article History: Received: 17/06/2025; Accepted: 30/06/2025; Published: 04/07/2025

Abstract: This paper throws light about the services of two scholars for Islam. The purpose of this paper is to differentiate the eastern birth Scholar Maulana Madoodi and the Western birth Scholar Allama Asad (after embracing Islam). Both scholars stress the necessity of modern reformation of Islamic civilization. It is considered that Maudoodi has strict point of view about establishing state for Islamic rules while Allama Asad considers implementation of Islamic rules at individual level first. On the matter of basic sources of Islam, Allama Asad considers Holy Quran and Sunnah (Hadith) important while in Madoodi's point of view, beside these sources, Ijmah and Ijtehad (Qayas) are also important. In Madoodi's point of view, Islamic civilization is based on divine guided and framework while Western civilization is based on secularism and socialism stressing upon wellbeing of human. In Allama Asad's point of view, Western culture and civilization is scientific and advanced than the Eastern world. Further Asad stated that the secular and religion less situation in the West is because of not presenting Islam in the West in true manner. In short, this paper has brief discussion of both scholars point of view about the reformation of Islamic civilization.

Keywords: *Islam; Civilization; Holy Quran; Hadith; Western culture; Crusades;*

Cite this article: Khan, T. M., USHAMA, T., (2025). A Comparative Study of Maulana Madoodi's views and Allama Asad's views on Modern Reformation of Islamic Civilization. *MRS Journal of Arts, Humanities and Literature*, 2 (7)15-18.

Objectives of Study

- To know about the reformation of Islamic civilization;
- To know about Asad's view about Islamic civilization;
- To know about Madoodi's view about Islamic civilization;
- To get knowledge about the different views of both scholars;
- To get knowledge about the similar views of both scholars;

Basic Statement of Study

Allama Muhammad Asad and Madoodi favor reformation of Islamic civilization.

Basic Question of Study

Are Madoodi's views and Allama Asad's views same about reformation of Islamic civilization?

Possible answers may be as under:

- Yes, Both have same views about reformation of Islamic civilization;
- No, Both have different views about reformation of Islamic civilization;

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-NC](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) license



- Both have same point of views about some aspects while in other aspects both have some different point of views.

Literature Review

In literature, different books written by Madoodi and his supporters' books are reviewed about Islamic civilization. Allama Asad' books and some orientalists' books are reviewed to know Asad and his supporters' views about the Islamic civilization. Mainly the both Scholars' books are utilized to get first-hand knowledge about the reformation of Islamic civilization. For example, Islamic state written by Madoodi, Legal status of political parties written by Muhammad Amin, The Road to Mecca written by Allama Muhammad Asad, Islam at the crossroads by Allama Muhammad Asad &etc.

Limitation of Research

This research is confined to both scholars' views about reformation of Islamic civilization.

PRESENTATION & EXPLANATION

Madoodi's and his supporters' views

Before discussing about views, it is better to present brief biography of Maudoodi. Maudoodi was born on September 25,

1903 in Aurang Abad city of Hyderabad, India, His father Maulana Hasan was among the early students of Ali Garh University who died in 1918. Then Maudoodi joined Journalism with his elder brother who was editor of this publication. Then he worked as a translator in an Indian Publication organization also. After 1926, he started to write books. He was sentenced of death by Military government in 1952-53 on the matter of Qadyani issue. But after this sentenced was changed by imprisonment. After two year he was released by court. He wrote many books on Islam and its different teachings. He wrote exegesis of Quran titled as Tafheemul Quran in six volumes in Urdu. He was shifted to America in year 1979 after heart attack for treatment. But after few days, he died in serious heart attack. His funeral prayer was performed in America then he was shifted to Lahore Ichra where his second funeral prayer was offered. Besides this in many countries his invisible funeral prayer was offered in regard of his services to Islam. Madoodi was a prominent figure of Islam and interpreter of Islamic thoughts. He also founded a Jamate Islami political and religious party which is still working up till now. His organization Turjuman al-Quran is also working in Lahore up till now. In the following lines, first Madoodi's and his supporters views about Islamic civilization are presented:

Islam has its own system of life in which for individual life and collective life matters, guidelines and regulations are presented to act upon.¹ In Madoodi's point of view, religion and culture not separated from one another. That politics which is free from religion, it is unwanted in Islam.²

In Khursheed's views, the adaptation of Alien culture is not allowed in Islamic state and relevant areas.³ In this way, one hadith shows the meanings that the person will be considered in those which he has adopted the ways of living.

The fact is that, after some decades of golden era of Islam, religion less government established and its bad effects spread over societies and no one could control it.⁴ After the thirty years caliphate of rightly guided caliphs, the dictatorship has changed the ways of Islamic rulings in Islamic states. So, the anti-state activities were crushed with iron hands ignoring the reasons and facts which has created disturbances and dissatisfaction in the people.

Presently in Europe, political parties system is prevailing. In Islam, there is no space for this system which creates disruption just only for getting states and authority in government.⁵ By imitating many Muslim countries are adopting democratic and voting system by which the mental and the capable have same authority and powers to choose the other by their votes which is not justice for the poor and able candidates of poor.

According to Niazi, In Islamic government, political parties can play an active role in election about selection of able and right

people who could support Islam and the work for implementation of Islam as a law.⁶ For preaching Islam, for training of individuals, nation and for societal services, people must work with religion and political parties also in an organized manner and way are better & permitted but it is also desirable and demanded.⁷

As concerned the teachings of Holy Quran, It has been stated in Chapter Al-Hujuraat: "O people, we have created you from man and from woman, and made you tribes and nations for your easy recognition."⁸ This shows that the concept of Islamic nation is beyond the territory and any type of limitation. In simple words, it may be stated that it is global concept of nation.

Islamic civilization stresses on thinking about the creation of mankind and the universe also. As in different chapters of Holy Quran it has been invited to men to use their reasoning. These are as Under: chapter Al-Shura: verse 53, Al-Imran: verse 190, Al-Nisa : verse 82, Al-Ra;ad: 16, Hood: 24. All these mentioned verses of Holy Quran encourages us to use intellect and think about the creation of mankind and the universe also.

For any society's development, peace and justice are important. Holy Quran informs and guides us in the following chapters and verses also. These are: Chapter Al-Nisa: verse 58, Chapter Al-Maidah: verse 8, peace and justice are important for development of any society whether it is Islamic or non-Islamic.

Islamic teachings condemn theocracy and monasticism as in chapter Sura Al-Hadeed verse 27 also guides us to adopt a moderate way. It is not Islam to live in forest by ignoring the rights of relative ones. As by neglecting the world and the rights of relative ones, no one imagine to accept Islam in a right way.

Muhammad Asad's & his supporters' views

Muhammad Asad Allama's birth name was 'Leo Pold Wies' born in Poland, city Lwow, which was under control of Austria, in Jewish family in year 1900. He visited abroad in 1922. He also started his career from the journalism and he was a traveler also. He embraced Islam in year 1926 after learning Arabic and Persian. He stayed in Saudi Arabia from 1926 to 1932 and got knowledge from learned persons. He had good relations with Pakistan Movement freedom personalities and learned persons so he Pakistani citizen after the establishment of Pakistan .He also played a significant role in newly built state regarding Islamic theology and ideology council. It is called that on the first day of Pakistan (on 14th August, 1947), he got Pakistani citizenship first from the whole world and he was also the first who got Pakistani Passport first from the all other Pakistanis also. This shows his love for Pakistan, a newly built Islamic state. He also worked as diplomatic and executive posts of newly built state of Pakistan. He was impressed from ibne Hazm's teachings, from Ibne Taimiya and Ibne Qayyem also. Besides these personalities, Mufti Abduhoo and Rasheed Raza's thoughts may be seen from Asad;s writings. Asad was buried in Granada in Muslim cemetery of Spain in 1992. Anyhow, his life does not remain safe from allegations of working as agent of Bolshevik by Iraqi personal named Abdullah who presented report to King Ibne Saud in which he alleged that asad has connections with Soviet authorities. In his writings, Asad

¹ Madoodi Abu Al-Aa'la (1990) Islamic state, Lahore :Islamic Publications, p-62

² Madoodi Abu Al-Aa'la (1997) , Explanations, Lahore : Al- Badar Publications, p-345.

³ Khursheed Ahmad (2002), future of civilization and Islam, Tarjuman al-Quran, April issue, pp- 3& 5

⁴ Nadvi Abu Al-Hasan (1940), Difference / Separation of religion and politics, Lahore: Turjuman Al-Quran, August, pp-9-10.

⁵ Madoodi Abu Al-Aa'la (1990) Islamic state, Lahore: Islamic Publications, p-369.

⁶ Kousa Niazi Maulana (1990), Evidences and opinions, Lahore: Jang Publications, p-17.

⁷ Muhammad Amin Maulana (1984), Legal status of political parties, Khushaab: Juahar Press, p-35.

⁸ Al-Quran, Chapter Al-Hujuraat:1 3.

claimed also that he did journey to Kuwait on the order of Ibne Saud king for secret mission to investigate about getting knowledge of Ikhwan funding. From this, the character is not clear as seems learned and Islamic thinker. Moreover, as concerned his stay in British India, it is stated that on demand of Iqbal to stay in India for working of separate Muslim state, Asad stayed after 1932 to onward and worked for Muslims of India with Iqbal and Niaz Ali Khan who was famous agriculturalist for the cause of independent state. Asad also declared that he did translation of Sahih Bukhari in English on encouragement of Iqbal about this. Anyhow, he has relations with the leaders of Pakistan movement before its establishment but he has vast travelling and stay experience among the different countries of the World. After establishment of Pakistan, he got citizenship of Pakistan and served as diplomatic positions also with his writings.

Asad tried to mold Islamic principles into modernity unlike Madoodi's. Asad considers Islam as a global message. While about reformation of Islamic civilization both scholars have same opinions. Both have linkage and relation with dr. Allama Iqbal and the some leaders of Pakistan Movement. But in establishing separate state for Muslims, Madoodi consider it compulsory for implementation of Islamic principles. But Allama Asad has opinion to adopt principles without gaining the separate state.

As concerned the matter of Jihad, Asad considers it compulsory only in the situation of defensive situation while Madoodi's point of view is different from this. Similarly, in the matters of basic sources of Islamic Law, he (Asad) prefers Quran and Hadith instead of other sources while Madoodi considers Iljma and Ijehad also after the Quran and Hadith. Any how about the division of deen and dunya both do not consider these separately from one another.

As Islam enters the most critical phase of its development in the West, Muhammad Asad's legacy assures and urgency, no thinking Muslim can afford to ignore.⁹ Thus an Islamic state is not a goal or an end in itself but only a means: the goal being the growth of a community of people who stand up for equity and justice, for right and against wrong.¹⁰ I thought that we latecomers needed that message even more desperately than did the people of Muhammad's time.¹¹

If the government issues laws and regulations which involve the commission of sin in the strict sharia sense, the obedience ceases to be operative with regard to these laws or regulations, if the govt. sets itself openly and deliberately against the nass ordinances of Quran.¹² The moral basis of modern western civilization is incompatible with Islam. Islam in sense is theoretical and practical religion.¹³ Islamic teachings stress to be same in inner and the outer ways of life.

In one way or other, all prophets have challenged the established order of their times.¹⁴ In Asad's views, I sometimes wonder because the values of Islam constitute a potential challenge to many Western concepts of spiritual and social life.¹⁵

According to Edward W. Said, Orientalists also are responsible to spread Islam in West disputes and hatred ness.¹⁶ In Montgomery's views, Asad's sayings are true that Islam is not presented in right manner in the West and effects of Crusades war are not free.¹⁷ Views of famous orientalist are true that effects of Crusades are not forgetful by the West.

In Asad's views, it will be the duty and the opportunity of Muslim scientists when they reach those borderlines of scientific investigations to apply their powers of speculative reasoning independently of Western philosophical theories.¹⁸ In Asad's point of view, some aspects of westernization must be ignorable but some other aspects of Western culture must be adopted because of their utility for Muslim Ummah.

According to Ranchman, In Asad's views Western have hatred about all the religions of the world while against Islam, they have sever hatred and jealousy because of Crusades.¹⁹ It seems an irony of history that the age old Western resentment against Islam and the shadow of Crusades however over the West to this day: and all its reactions towards Islam and the Muslim world bear distinct traces.²⁰ It may be stated also that Asad presented Islam to the West in a learned manner. From his invitation towards Islam, German ambassador Murad Hoop man, Scholar Mariam Jamila, & Fatima Kaleen are notable to embraced Islam.

Besides this, some points of both scholars' life are as under:

Both scholars took birth in start of 20th century, both started practical life at the age of 15, both joined journalism profession, both translated books, both have relations with Allama Dr. Muhammad Iqbal & both were imprisoned both have written books on Islam, Quran, Islamic state and culture and both were died outside of their country. And both scholars' views are still valuable and being quoted as an authority in reformation of Islamic civilization.

The fact is that the Islamic civilization does not remain safe from the effects European & Western culture. This is why material values have been promoted in Islamic civilization also with the other civilizations of the world. The concept of justice which was main essence of Islamic culture and civilization, now this has been neglected because of individual preference over the collective preferences. Due to this, individual wealth of persons is increasing while societal wealth is being decreased. The real drawback of Muslim societies is giving preference to material values over the Islamic values. The difference may be imagined just from one

⁹ Zilur Rehman Hassan (1995), Muhammad Asad: Visionary Islamic Scholar, Washington report on Middle East Affairs, Sep. pp-45-46.

¹⁰ Muhammad Asad Allama (1980), The principles of state & government in Islam, Gibraltar: Dar Al- Andulus, P-30.

¹¹ Ahmad Schman to M.Saleem (1956), Message to M. Saleem Lahore: dated 28th July, Hannover Germany.

¹² Muhammad Asad Allama (1980). The principles of state & government in Islam, Pp-79-80.

¹³ Muhammad Asad Allama (1982), Islam at the crossroads, Gibraltar: Dar Al- Andulus, P-69.

¹⁴ Muhammad Asad Allama (1954). The road to Mecca, London: Max Reinhardt, p-291.

¹⁵ Muhammad Asad Allama (1954), The road to Mecca, p-5..

¹⁶ Edward W.Said(1978), Orientalism, London: Rutledge, & covering Islam, Pantheon Books , New Delhi, 1981

¹⁷ Montgomery Watt (1974), The Majesty that was Islam, London: Sedgwick & Jackson, pp-247-248.

¹⁸ Muhammad Asad Allama (1982), Islam at the crossroads, Gibraltar: Dar Al- Andulus, p-93.

¹⁹ S. Ranchman (1951). A history of Crusades, Cambridge University press, New York, pp-56-60.

²⁰ Muhammad Asad Allama (1954) The road to Mecca, p-7.

point that members of Islamic society who present sacrifice in the field of war, now they prefer themselves in normal life because of neglecting the Islamic teachings, values, and even the sacrifice for the other.

Concluding Remarks

In nutshell, it may be stated that both scholars belong to first decade of twentieth century. Madoodi took birth in Muslim family while Asad took birth in Poland in a Jewish family. But Asad embraced Islam after learning Arabic and Persian languages from the learned Islamic scholars; this is why he has knowledge of both civilizations Eastern and the Western as well as the knowledge of both scholars' books Eastern and the Western. Both scholars started professional life from the journalism career in spite of one was in the East while the other was in the West. Both scholars Asad and Madoodi have same opinions about Modern reformation of Islamic civilization. But Madoodi has different point of view from Asad on the matter of Jihad as Asad allowed Jihad only in defensive situation but Madoodi considered it both in

defensive and offensive situations. Similarly on the matter of basic sources of Islamic Shariah, Madoodi consider Holy Quran, Hadith, Ijmah and Ijtehad while Asad preferred Holy Quran and Hadith as basic sources. Furthermore, Asad declared that the main reason of Western hatred about Islam is the because of Crusades war and not presenting Islam in true manner in the West. Because of these reasons Western have negative thoughts against all the religions of world. In short, it may be stated that both scholars have similarity in some aspects while difference of opinions in some other aspects regarding reformation of Islamic civilization and culture.

Conflict of Research

It is stated that there is no conflict in completing this research.

Funding & Support

It is stated, this research is conducted without any type of support or funding. This research has been completed by scholars individually.